

# Tinton Falls School District Evaluation Committee Report for the Custodial, Maintenance, Grounds and Management Services RFP

## 1. List of Proposers:

- ABM
- Aramark
- Pritchard

## 2. List of Evaluation Committee Members:

- Vin Daniels
- Lisa Goldley
- Jessica Black

# Evaluation Committee Report

## 3. Cost of Proposals (Ranked from lowest to highest five year price) :

Tinton Falls Comparison of Proposal Form A - PRICING						
Description	Details	Aramark		Pritchard		ABM
		Percent	Total Charges	Percent	Total Charges	Total Charges
Custodial	Charge for Wages		\$148,805.76		\$124,380.80	\$136,864.00
	Charge for Health Care Benefits	40%	\$59,558.40	38%	\$47,185.60	\$46,365.00
	Charge for Other Fringe Benefits	9%	\$13,879.26	2%	\$2,170.00	\$5,857.00
	Charge for Payroll Taxes	9%	\$13,805.91	19%	\$23,072.64	\$24,988.94
Consultant Recom'd FTE's	14.00	No. of FTEs (1 FTE=752 Hours) -	12.00	14.00	14.00	
Consultant Recom'd Wage Rate	\$13.95	Avg. Wage Rate Excl. Benefits & Taxes	\$16.49	\$11.81	\$13.00	
Custodial Overtime	Charge for Wages		\$4,130.75		\$2,959.48	\$3,256.50
	Charge for Payroll Taxes	9%	\$383.24	19%	\$548.98	\$594.58
	Required Hours	167	Number of Annual Hours	167	167	167
	Consultant Recom'd Wage Rate	\$0.00	Avg. Wage Rate Excl. Benefits & Taxes	\$24.74	\$17.72	\$19.50
Custodial - Head/Leads	Charge for Wages		\$40,585.44		\$37,449.60	\$38,352.00
	Charge for Health Care Benefits	37%	\$14,889.60	27%	\$10,111.20	\$9,935.00
	Charge for Other Fringe Benefits	9%	\$3,655.57	1%	\$465.00	\$1,255.00
	Charge for Payroll Taxes	9%	\$3,714.10	19%	\$6,946.90	\$6,840.52
Consultant Recom'd FTE's	3.00	No. of FTEs (1 FTE=752 Hours) -	3.00	3.00	3.00	
Consultant Recom'd Wage Rate	\$17.00	Avg. Wage Rate Excl. Benefits & Taxes	\$17.99	\$16.60	\$17.00	
Custodial Heads/Lead Overtime	Charge for Wages		\$890.51		\$821.70	\$841.50
	Charge for Payroll Taxes	9%	\$81.49	19%	\$152.43	\$150.09
	Required Hours	33	Number of Annual Hours	33	33	33
	Consultant Recom'd Wage Rate	\$0.00	Avg. Wage Rate Excl. Benefits & Taxes	\$26.99	\$24.90	\$25.50
Maintenance	Charge for Wages		\$52,700.16		\$52,700.16	\$78,960.00
	Charge for Health Care Benefits	6%	\$3,190.94	19%	\$10,111.20	\$9,227.00
	Charge for Other Fringe Benefits	8%	\$4,267.90	1%	\$465.00	\$1,216.00
	Charge for Payroll Taxes	9%	\$4,640.17	19%	\$9,775.88	\$11,765.04
Consultant Recom'd FTE's	3.00	No. of FTEs (1 FTE=752 Hours) -	3.00	3.00	3.00	
Consultant Recom'd Wage Rate	\$23.36	Avg. Wage Rate Excl. Benefits & Taxes	\$23.36	\$23.36	\$35.00	
Prevailing Wages for Maintenance	Charge for Wages		\$20,516.51		\$23,823.36	\$14,607.88
	Charge for Other Fringe Benefits	128%	\$26,195.99	0%	\$0.00	\$405.00
	Charge for Payroll Taxes	9%	\$1,777.32	19%	\$4,419.23	\$2,169.00
	Incremental Average Hourly Wage Rate	752		744		298
Maintenance Overtime	Charge for Wages		\$1,156.32		\$1,156.32	\$1,732.50
	Charge for Payroll Taxes	9%	\$101.80	19%	\$214.50	\$258.14
	Required Hours	33	Number of Annual Hours	33	33	33
	Consultant Recom'd Wage Rate	\$0.00	Avg. Wage Rate Excl. Benefits & Taxes	\$35.04	\$35.04	\$52.50
Grounds	Charge for Wages		\$40,833.60		\$30,230.40	\$35,644.80
	Charge for Health Care Benefits	8%	\$3,190.94	33%	\$10,111.20	\$9,227.00
	Charge for Other Fringe Benefits	6%	\$2,396.01	2%	\$465.00	\$1,216.00
	Charge for Payroll Taxes	9%	\$3,733.17	19%	\$5,607.74	\$5,311.08
Consultant Recom'd FTE's	3.00	No. of FTEs (1 FTE=752 Hours) -	3.00	3.00	3.00	
Consultant Recom'd Wage Rate	\$15.77	Avg. Wage Rate Excl. Benefits & Taxes	\$18.10	\$13.40	\$15.80	
Grounds Overtime	Charge for Wages		\$895.95		\$663.30	\$782.10
	Charge for Payroll Taxes	9%	\$81.91	19%	\$123.04	\$116.53
	Required Hours	33	Number of Annual Hours	33	33	33
	Consultant Recom'd Wage Rate	\$0.00	Avg. Wage Rate Excl. Benefits & Taxes	\$27.15	\$20.10	\$23.70
General Manager	Charge for Wages		\$41,215.38		\$41,215.38	\$40,698.24
	Charge for Health Care Benefits	12%	\$4,920.54	5%	\$2,250.00	\$4,453.00
	Charge for Other Fringe Benefits	6%	\$2,361.64	0%	\$0.00	\$215.50
	Charge for Payroll Taxes	8%	\$3,360.86	19%	\$7,645.45	\$6,064.04
Consultant Recom'd FTE's	1.00	No. of FTEs (1 FTE=752 Hours) -	1.00	1.00	1.00	
Consultant Recom'd Wage Rate	\$54.81	Avg. Wage Rate Excl. Benefits & Taxes	\$54.81	\$54.81	\$54.12	
Maintenance Manager	Charge for Wages		\$16,721.15		\$0.00	\$16,393.60
	Charge for Health Care Benefits	22%	\$3,669.62	0%	\$0.00	\$3,075.00
	Charge for Other Fringe Benefits	6%	\$958.12	0%	\$0.00	\$148.50
	Charge for Payroll Taxes	9%	\$1,487.37	0%	\$0.00	\$2,442.65
Consultant Recom'd FTE's	1.00	No. of FTEs (1 FTE=752 Hours) -	1.00	0.00	1.00	
Consultant Recom'd Wage Rate	\$22.24	Avg. Wage Rate Excl. Benefits & Taxes	\$22.24	\$0.00	\$21.80	
Custodial Evening Supervisors	Charge for Wages		\$0.00		\$16,721.15	\$0.00
	Charge for Health Care Benefits	0%	\$0.00	13%	\$2,250.00	\$0.00
	Charge for Other Fringe Benefits	0%	\$0.00	0%	\$0.00	\$0.00
	Charge for Payroll Taxes	0%	\$0.00	19%	\$3,101.77	\$0.00
Consultant Recom'd FTE's	0.00	No. of FTEs (1 FTE=752 Hours) -	0.00	1.00	0.00	
Consultant Recom'd Wage Rate	\$0.00	Avg. Wage Rate Excl. Benefits & Taxes	\$0.00	\$22.24	\$0.00	
Clerical	Charge for Wages		\$13,881.92		\$13,881.92	\$13,611.20
	Charge for Health Care Benefits	8%	\$1,076.82	0%	\$0.00	\$1,702.00
	Charge for Other Fringe Benefits	6%	\$795.52	0%	\$0.00	\$132.00
	Charge for Payroll Taxes	9%	\$1,270.18	19%	\$2,575.10	\$2,028.07
Consultant Recom'd FTE's	1.00	No. of FTEs (1 FTE=752 Hours) -	1.00	1.00	1.00	
Consultant Recom'd Wage Rate	\$18.46	Avg. Wage Rate Excl. Benefits & Taxes	\$18.46	\$18.46	\$18.10	
Contractor Start Up Charges –						
Total amount amortized over 5 years:		Annual Charges	\$0.00		\$0.00	\$4,274.60
Contractor Equipment Budget/Pool \$60,000		All Proposed \$60,000				
Total amount amortized over 5 years:		Annual Charges	\$12,000.00		\$12,000.00	\$12,000.00
Contractor Charge for Computerized Quality Assurance System			\$1,550.28		\$1.00	\$1,805.00
Contractor Charge for Office and or Warehouse Rent			\$0.00		\$1.00	\$0.00
Contractor Charge for Required Office Equipment			\$2,402.42		\$1,640.00	\$3,869.00
Contractor Charge for Supplies and On-Going Operating Costs			\$21,291.31		\$20,330.53	\$36,026.00
Contractor Management Fee		3.0%	\$18,835.86	3.8%	\$21,189.76	\$45,000.00
District Charge for Contract Monitoring			\$4,000.00		\$4,000.00	\$4,000.00
Total Contract Charge 9 Days And 4 Months From February 20, 2020 To June 30, 2020			\$621,857.72		\$554,933.73	\$645,876.60

# Evaluation Committee Report

Tinton Falls Comparison of Proposal Form A - PRICING							
Description	Details	Aramark		Pritchard		ABM	
		Percent	Total Charges	Percent	Total Charges	Percent	Total Charges
Custodial	Charge for Wages		\$411,590.40		\$452,816.00		\$463,881.60
	Charge for Health Care Benefits	40%	\$164,736.00	46%	\$207,648.00	28%	\$128,436.00
	Charge for Other Fringe Benefits	9%	\$38,389.43	1%	\$5,208.00	3%	\$16,226.00
	Charge for Payroll Taxes	9%	\$38,186.57	19%	\$83,997.37	15%	\$71,783.00
	Consultant Recom'd FTE's	14.00	No. of FTEs (1 FTE=2080 Hours per Year)	12.00	14.00	14.00	14.00
Consultant Recom'd Wage Rate	\$13.95	Avg. Wage Rate Excl. Benefits & Taxes	\$16.49	\$15.55	\$15.93		
Custodial Overtime	Charge for Wages		\$12,367.50		\$11,662.50		\$11,947.50
	Charge for Payroll Taxes	9%	\$1,147.43	19%	\$2,163.39	15%	\$1,848.00
	Required Hours	500	Number of Annual Hours	500	500	500	
	Consultant Recom'd Wage Rate	\$20.93	Avg. Wage Rate Excl. Benefits & Taxes	\$24.74	\$23.33	\$23.90	
Custodial - Head/Leads	Charge for Wages		\$112,257.60		\$109,512.00		\$126,984.00
	Charge for Health Care Benefits	37%	\$41,184.00	41%	\$44,496.00	22%	\$27,522.00
	Charge for Other Fringe Benefits	9%	\$10,111.14	1%	\$1,116.00	3%	\$3,477.00
	Charge for Payroll Taxes	9%	\$10,273.05	19%	\$20,314.48	15%	\$19,459.00
	Consultant Recom'd FTE's	3.00	No. of FTEs (1 FTE=2080 Hours per Year)	3.00	3.00	3.00	
Consultant Recom'd Wage Rate	\$17.00	Avg. Wage Rate Excl. Benefits & Taxes	\$17.99	\$17.55	\$20.35		
Custodial Heads/Lead Overtime	Charge for Wages		\$2,698.50		\$2,632.50		\$3,052.50
	Charge for Payroll Taxes	9%	\$246.95	19%	\$488.33	15%	\$468.00
	Required Hours	100	Number of Annual Hours	100	100	100	
Consultant Recom'd Wage Rate	\$25.50	Avg. Wage Rate Excl. Benefits & Taxes	\$26.99	\$26.33	\$30.53		
Maintenance	Charge for Wages		\$145,766.40		\$149,198.40		\$224,640.00
	Charge for Health Care Benefits	6%	\$8,826.00	0%	\$0.56	11%	\$25,560.00
	Charge for Other Fringe Benefits	8%	\$11,804.84	1%	\$1,116.00	2%	\$3,369.60
	Charge for Payroll Taxes	9%	\$12,834.51	19%	\$27,676.30	15%	\$33,359.00
	Consultant Recom'd FTE's	3.000	No. of FTEs (1 FTE=2080 Hours per Year)	3.00	3.00	3.00	
Consultant Recom'd Wage Rate	\$23.36	Avg. Wage Rate Excl. Benefits & Taxes	\$23.36	\$23.91	\$36.00		
Prevailing Wages for Maintenance	Charge for Wages		\$56,747.80		\$65,894.40		\$40,768.00
	Charge for Other Fringe Benefits	128%	\$72,457.00	0%	\$0.00	3%	\$1,123.20
	Charge for Payroll Taxes	9%	\$4,916.00	19%	\$12,223.41	15%	\$6,054.00
	Number of Hours 7-1-2015 to 6-30-2016	2,080	Incremental Average Hourly Wage Rate	\$27.28	\$32.00	\$49.00	
Maintenance Overtime	Charge for Wages		\$3,504.00		\$3,586.50		\$5,400.00
	Charge for Payroll Taxes	9%	\$308.49	19%	\$665.30	15%	\$801.90
	Required Hours	100	Number of Annual Hours	100	100	100	
Consultant Recom'd Wage Rate	\$35.04	Avg. Wage Rate Excl. Benefits & Taxes	\$35.04	\$35.87	\$54.00		
Grounds	Charge for Wages		\$112,944.00		\$109,512.00		\$101,712.00
	Charge for Health Care Benefits	8%	\$8,826.00	41%	\$44,496.00	25%	\$25,560.00
	Charge for Other Fringe Benefits	6%	\$6,627.26	41%	\$44,496.00	3%	\$3,369.60
	Charge for Payroll Taxes	9%	\$10,325.78	19%	\$20,314.48	15%	\$15,104.00
	Consultant Recom'd FTE's	3.00	No. of FTEs (1 FTE=2080 Hours per Year)	3.00	3.00	3.00	
Consultant Recom'd Wage Rate	\$15.77	Avg. Wage Rate Excl. Benefits & Taxes	\$18.10	\$17.55	\$16.30		
Grounds Overtime	Charge for Wages		\$2,715.00		\$2,632.50		\$2,445.00
	Charge for Payroll Taxes	9%	\$248.22	19%	\$488.33	15%	\$364.31
	Required Hours	100	Number of Annual Hours	100	100	100	
Consultant Recom'd Wage Rate	\$0.00	Avg. Wage Rate Excl. Benefits & Taxes	\$27.15	\$26.33	\$24.45		
General Manager	Charge for Wages		\$114,000.00		\$114,000.00		\$115,939.20
	Charge for Health Care Benefits	12%	\$13,610.00	5%	\$5,400.00	11%	\$12,336.00
	Charge for Other Fringe Benefits	6%	\$6,532.20	0%	\$0.00	1%	\$650.00
	Charge for Payroll Taxes	8%	\$9,296.00	19%	\$21,147.00	15%	\$17,216.00
	Consultant Recom'd FTE's	1.00	No. of FTEs (1 FTE=2080 Hours per Year)	1.00	1.00	1.00	
Consultant Recom'd Wage Rate	\$54.81	Avg. Wage Rate Excl. Benefits & Taxes	\$54.81	\$54.81	\$55.74		
Maintenance Manager	Charge for Wages		\$46,250.00		\$0.00		\$46,696.00
	Charge for Health Care Benefits	22%	\$10,150.00	0%	\$0.00	18%	\$8,520.00
	Charge for Other Fringe Benefits	6%	\$2,650.13	0%	\$0.00	1%	\$450.00
	Charge for Payroll Taxes	9%	\$4,114.00	0%	\$0.00	15%	\$6,957.70
Consultant Recom'd FTE's	1.00	No. of FTEs (1 FTE=2080 Hours per Year)	1.00	0.00	1.00		
Consultant Recom'd Wage Rate	\$22.24	Avg. Wage Rate Excl. Benefits & Taxes	\$22.24	\$0.00	\$22.45		
Custodial Evening Supervisors	Charge for Wages		\$0.00		\$46,250.00		\$0.00
	Charge for Health Care Benefits	0%	\$0.00	12%	\$5,400.00	0%	\$0.00
	Charge for Other Fringe Benefits	0%	\$0.00	0%	\$0.00	0%	\$0.00
	Charge for Payroll Taxes	0%	\$0.00	19%	\$8,579.38	0%	\$0.00
Consultant Recom'd FTE's	0.00	No. of FTEs (1 FTE=2080 Hours per Year)	0.00	1.00	0.00		
Consultant Recom'd Wage Rate	\$0.00	Avg. Wage Rate Excl. Benefits & Taxes	\$0.00	\$22.24	\$0.00		
Clerical	Charge for Wages		\$38,396.80		\$38,396.80		\$38,771.20
	Charge for Health Care Benefits	8%	\$2,978.45	0%	\$0.00	12%	\$4,716.00
	Charge for Other Fringe Benefits	6%	\$2,200.39	0%	\$0.00	1%	\$476.00
	Charge for Payroll Taxes	9%	\$3,513.25	19%	\$7,122.61	15%	\$5,776.91
Consultant Recom'd FTE's	1.00	No. of FTEs (1 FTE=2080 Hours per Year)	1.00	1.00	1.00		
Consultant Recom'd Wage Rate	\$18.46	Avg. Wage Rate Excl. Benefits & Taxes	\$18.46	\$18.46	\$18.64		
Contractor Start Up Charges -							
Total amount amortized over 5 years:		Annual Charges					
		\$0.00		\$0.00		\$4,274.60	
Contractor Equipment Budget/Pool \$60,000		All Proposed \$60,000					
Total amount amortized over 5 years:		Annual Charges					
		\$12,000.00		\$12,000.00		\$12,000.00	
Contractor Charge for Computerized Quality Assurance System		\$4,288.00		\$1.00		\$5,000.00	
Contractor Charge for Office and or Warehouse Rent		\$0.00		\$1.00		\$0.00	
Contractor Charge for Required Office Equipment		\$6,645.00		\$2,620.00		\$10,720.00	
Contractor Charge for Supplies and On-Going Operating Costs		\$58,890.86		\$90,588.12		\$99,796.00	
Contractor Management Fee		3.0%		\$51,017.31		3.8%	
District Charge for Contract Monitoring				\$71,034.43		6.9%	
		\$12,000.00		\$12,000.00		\$131,880.00	
		\$12,000.00		\$12,000.00		\$12,000.00	
<b>TOTAL CONTRACT CHARGE YEAR TWO 2020-2021</b>							
		\$1,700,572.26		\$1,858,895.07		\$1,898,890.82	

# Evaluation Committee Report

Tinton Falls Comparison of Proposal Form A - PRICING							
Description	Details	Aramark		Pritchard		ABM	
		Percent	Total Charges	Percent	Total Charges	Percent	Total Charges
<b>CONTRACT CHARGE SUMMARY</b>							
Total Contract Charge 9 Days And 4 Months From February 20, 2020 To June 30, 2020			\$621,857.72		\$554,933.73		\$645,876.60
<b>TOTAL CONTRACT CHARGE YEAR TWO (2020-2021)</b>			\$1,700,572.26		\$1,858,895.07		\$1,898,890.82
Increase for 2020-2021 - Input Dollar Amount		3.8%	\$64,621.75	3.1%	\$57,827.27	8.1%	\$154,342.00
<b>TOTAL CONTRACT CHARGE YEAR THREE (2021-2022)</b>			\$1,765,194.00		\$1,916,722.34		\$2,053,232.82
Increase for 2021-2022 - Input Dollar Amount		3.7%	\$65,312.18	3.0%	\$56,976.89	3.5%	\$71,011.76
<b>TOTAL CONTRACT CHARGE YEAR FOUR (2022-2023)</b>			\$1,830,506.18		\$1,973,699.23		\$2,124,244.58
Increase for 2022-2023 - Input Dollar Amount		3.8%	\$69,559.23	3.4%	\$67,463.69	3.5%	\$73,497.17
<b>TOTAL CONTRACT CHARGE YEAR FIVE (2023-2024)</b>			\$1,900,065.42		\$2,041,162.92		\$2,197,741.75
<b>Total Contract Charge for the Nine (9) Days, Four (4) Months and Four (4) Years</b>			\$7,818,195.59		\$8,345,413.28		\$8,919,986.57

# Evaluation Committee Report

## 4. Evaluation Criteria:

<b>The Criteria Used in Evaluating Proposals</b> <i>The points awarded range from 1 to 5, with 5 being the highest score and 1 being the lowest</i>	<b>Weighting Factor</b>	<b>Points</b>
<b>1. Program Price:</b> What is the price of the program proposed and its impact upon the district's operating budgets? Are the charges detailed in the proposal form realistic; i.e., Health care costs, payroll taxes, management fee, etc.	15%	1 to 5
<b>2. Contractor's financial viability, strength, capability and record of performance:</b> Considers the Contractor's capability and experience as measured by financial statements, performance record, litigation, years in the industry, number of public school districts served and references.	12%	1 to 5
<b>3. On-Site Management:</b> Considers the references; proposal resumes, face to face interviews and any other method to discover the capabilities and skill level of the on-site management. At a minimum the proposed candidate must demonstrate the following: <b>General Manager:</b> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Should have at least two years' experience in managing a comparable sized public school district.</li> <li>Should have more than five years' experience in the facilities management industry.</li> <li>Should hold a NJ Black Seal license.</li> <li>Must have a high school diploma or GED equivalent diploma.</li> <li>Must be a NJ Certified Educational Facilities Manager (CEFM) pursuant to 18A:17-49 or obtain it within two years of contract start date.</li> <li>Must be fluent in English.</li> </ol> <b>Custodial/Maintenance Manager/Supervisor/s:</b> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Should have at least one year experience in managing a comparable sized public school district.</li> <li>Should have two years' experience in the custodial/maintenance industry.</li> <li>Should have a Black Seal license.</li> <li>Should be fluent in English and Spanish.</li> <li>Must have a high school diploma or GED equivalent diploma.</li> </ul>	25%	1 to 5
<b>4. Staffing Viability:</b> Considers whether proposed wages and staffing levels are sufficient to recruit and maintain a stable workforce by comparing the proposed wage rates to the following: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>The New Jersey Department of Labor's most current OES Wage Data Survey for average wages for the District's county for custodial, maintenance, grounds, management and clerical positions as detailed in Exhibit 6.</li> <li>The current outsourced average wage rates and wages as detailed in the current outsourced roster in Exhibit 6.</li> <li>The Consultant's Recommended Staffing, Wage Rates and Salaries as detailed in Exhibit 7.</li> <li>Are benefits and paid time off provided/offered and employee contribution to insurance premiums and copays/deductibles sufficient to recruit and maintain a stable workforce?</li> <li>Is the number of proposed custodial, maintenance, grounds management and clerical staff sufficient to meet the Scope of Work in this RFP?</li> </ul>	24%	1 to 5
<b>5. Contractor's Proposed Program:</b> Are the Proposer's program, systems, training, and procedures for custodial and management services thorough and comprehensive enough to meet the scope of work?	10%	1 to 5
<b>6. Contractor's Start Up/Transition Plan:</b> Is the Proposer's start-up plan customized to the needs of the District? Is the plan detailed from pre- planning (30 days prior to the start of the contract) through the start of the contract and the first three months to February 1, 2020? Did it detail the additional management and resources they shall be providing as well as the startup tasks, any requirements for the District, implementation date, estimated completion date, and who is responsible (name and title)? Did the plan have 100 or more different (not repetitive) tasks listed covering the startup activities in implementation, management, HR, custodial, maintenance, grounds and training? Was it submitted in Excel format or a Gantt chart?	14%	1 to 5

# Evaluation Committee Report

## 5. Scoring:

TOTALS							
CRITERIA	Weighing Percent	Points Awarded (1 to 5)			Weighted Points		
		ABM	Aramark	Pritchard	ABM	Aramark	Pritchard
Program Price:	15%	9.00	15.00	12.00	1.350	2.250	1.800
Contractor's capability and record of performance:	12%	15.00	15.00	15.00	1.800	1.800	1.800
On-Site Management:	25%	9.00	15.00	12.00	2.250	3.750	3.000
Staffing Viability	24%	15.00	12.00	15.00	3.600	2.880	3.600
Contractor's Proposed Program:	10%	15.00	15.00	15.00	1.500	1.500	1.500
Contractor's Start Up/Transition Plan:	14%	15.00	15.00	15.00	2.100	2.100	2.100
<b>TOTALS</b>	<b>100%</b>	<b>78.00</b>	<b>87.00</b>	<b>84.00</b>	<b>12.600</b>	<b>14.280</b>	<b>13.800</b>

## 6. Scoring Summary

- a. **Aramark: 14.28 Points** – Aramark ranked number one for Program Price because they had the lowest five year price. Contractor's Capability and Record of Performance was based on the references provided as well as financial stability and was worthy of a tie for first place. For On-Site Management, Aramark's proposed candidate stood out as being the strongest therefore ranked the highest. The proposed staffing, wages and benefits provided caused their proposal to be ranked the lowest for Staffing Viability. Aramark tied in the Contractor's Proposed Program and the Contractor's Startup/Transition Plan.
- b. **Pritchard: 13.80 Points** - Pritchard had the second lowest price which earned them the second place ranking for Program Price. Their references were good enough to earn a tie with the other two contractors in Capability and Record of Performance. In reviewing the resume and the interview of Pritchard's proposed candidate, they were given the second highest score for On-Site Management. Pritchard also received a tie for the highest score for Staffing Viability. They tied in the Contractor's Proposed Program and the Contractor's Startup/Transition Plan.
- c. **ABM: 12.60 Points** - ABM had the highest price and therefore the lowest score. The school districts served and references had them tie with Aramark and Pritchard for Contractor's Capability and Record of Performance. ABM's proposed candidate ranked third amongst the companies for On-Site Management. ABM tied for the highest score in Staffing Viability. They tied in the Contractor's Proposed Program and the Contractor's Startup/Transition Plan.

## 7. Recommendation of the Tinton Falls School District's Custodial, Maintenance, Grounds and Management Services RFP Evaluation Committee:

- Upon review of the proposals submitted and based upon the RFP evaluation criteria, the Evaluation Committee concludes that the Aramark proposal is most advantageous for the Tinton Falls School District.